

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE**

IN RE: ARMODAFINIL PATENT LITIGATION	)	MDL Docket No.: 1:10-md-2200-GMS
	)	
CEPHALON, INC. and CEPHALON FRANCE, Plaintiffs,	)	
v. WATSON LABORATORIES, INC., Defendant.	)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-7-GMS
	)	
CEPHALON INC. and CEPHALON FRANCE, Plaintiffs,	)	
v. SANDOZ INC., Defendant.	)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-55-GMS Civil Action No. 1:11-cv-782-GMS
	)	
CEPHALON INC. and CEPHALON FRANCE, Plaintiffs,	)	
v. LUPIN LIMITED, Defendant.	)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-210-GMS
	)	
CEPHALON INC. and CEPHALON FRANCE, Plaintiffs,	)	
v. APOTEX INC., Defendants.	)	Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-695-GMS Civil Action No. 1:10-cv-1078-GMS
	)	

**DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' RULE 52(c) MOTION FOR  
JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW**

Defendants Watson Laboratories, Inc., Sandoz Inc., Lupin Limited and Apotex Inc. (“Defendants”) hereby submit this response to Cephalon’s motion for judgment as a matter of law. (D.I. 300.) Defendants oppose the motion. However, pursuant to the Court’s July 24, 2012 instruction, Defendants do not provide the full basis for their opposition in this paper, but will

fully respond to the merits of Cephalon's motion for judgment as a matter of law in post-trial briefing.

Dated: July 31, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

PHILLIPS, GOLDMAN & SPENCE, P.A.

*Of Counsel:*

/s/ John C. Phillips, Jr.  
John C. Phillips, Jr. (#110)  
Megan C. Haney (#5016)  
1200 North Broom Street  
Wilmington, Delaware 19806  
(302) 655-4200  
jcp@pgslaw.com  
mch@pgslaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendant  
Watson Laboratories, Inc.*

Michael K. Nutter  
Kevin E. Warner  
David Luger  
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP  
35 West Wacker Drive  
Chicago, Illinois 60601  
mnutter@winston.com  
kwarner@winston.com  
dluger@winston.com

PROCTOR HEYMAN LLP

*Of Counsel:*

/s/ Neal C. Belgam  
Neal C. Belgam (#2721)  
300 Delaware Avenue, Suite 200  
Wilmington, Delaware 19801  
(302) 472-7300  
nbelgam@proctorheyman.com

*Attorneys for Defendant  
Sandoz Inc.*

Jeffrey R. Gargano  
Peter M. Siavelis  
Wan-Shon Lo  
Rita J. Yoon  
MCDERMOTT WILL & EMERY LLP  
227 West Monroe Street, Suite 4400  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
jgargano@mwe.com  
psiavelis@mwe.com  
slo@mwe.com  
ryoona@mwe.com

BAYARD, P.A.

/s/ Stephen B. Brauerman

Richard D. Kirk (#922)  
Stephen B. Brauerman (#4952)  
222 Delaware Avenue, Suite 900  
P.O. Box 25130  
Wilmington, Delaware 19899  
rkirk@bayardlaw.com  
sbrauerman@bayardlaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendant  
Lupin Limited*

FLASTER/GREENBERG P.C.

/s/ Nella M. Bloom

William J. Burnett (#4078)  
Nella M. Bloom (#5430)  
913 North Market Street, Suite 900  
Wilmington, Delaware 19801  
(302) 351-1910  
william.burnett@flastergreenberg.com  
nella.bloom@flastergreenberg.com

*Attorneys for Defendant  
Apotex Inc.*

*Of Counsel:*

Barry S. White  
Steven M. Amundson  
Vicki Franks  
FROMMER LAWRENCE & HAUG LLP  
745 Fifth Avenue  
New York, New York 10151  
bwhite@flhllaw.com  
samundson@flhllaw.com  
vfranks@flhllaw.com

*Of Counsel:*

Robert B. Breisblatt  
Craig M. Kuchii  
Martin S. Masar, III  
KATTEN MUCHIN ROSENMAN LLP  
525 West Monroe Street  
Chicago, Illinois 60661  
robert.breisblatt@kattenlaw.com  
craig.kuchii@kattenlaw.com  
martin.masar@kattenlaw.com

Jeffrey A. Cohen  
FLASTER/GREENBERG P.C.  
Commerce Center  
1810 Chapel Avenue West  
Cherry Hill, New Jersey 08002-4609  
jeffrey.cohen@flastergreenberg.com

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the 31th day of July, 2012, I served a true and correct copy of **DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' RULE 52(c) MOTION FOR JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW** on the counsel of record for Plaintiffs listed below in the manner indicated:

**VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

CONNOLLY, BOVE, LODGE & HUTZ LLP

Mary W. Bourke (#2356)  
Dana K. Severance (#4869)  
The Nemours Building  
1007 North Orange Street  
P.O. Box 2207  
Wilmington, Delaware 19899  
(302) 658-9141  
mbourke@cblh.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*  
*Cephalon Inc. and Cephalon France*

**VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

*Of Counsel:*  
Charles E. Lipsey  
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,  
GARRETT & DUNNER, L.L.P.  
Two Freedom Square  
11955 Freedom Drive  
Reston, Virginia 20190  
(571) 203-2700  
charlie.lipsey@finnegan.com

Barbara R. Rudolph  
Mark J. Feldstein  
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,  
GARRETT & DUNNER, L.L.P.  
901 New York Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
(202) 408-4000  
barbara.rudolph@finnegan.com  
mark.feldstein@finnegan.com

Robert C. Stanley  
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,  
GARRETT & DUNNER, L.L.P.  
3500 SunTrust Plaza  
303 Peachtree Street, N.E.  
Atlanta, Georgia 30308  
(404) 653-6400  
robert.stanley@finnegan.com

John C. Englander  
Daryl L. Wiesen  
GOODWIN PROCTER LLP  
Exchange Place  
53 State Street

Boston, Massachusetts 02109  
(617) 570-1000  
[jenglander@goodwinprocter.com](mailto:jenglander@goodwinprocter.com)  
[dwiesen@goodwinprocter.com](mailto:dwiesen@goodwinprocter.com)

/s/Nella M. Bloom  
Nella M. Bloom, Esquire (I.D. #5430)